



**DRAFT MINUTES OF THE STANDING COMMITTEE ON ANTI-CORRUPTION  
(CAC) OF THE WORLD FEDERATION OF ENGINEERING ORGANISATIONS  
(WFEO) HELD ON WEDNESDAY 10TH DECEMBER 2014, AT 09:00 HRS, IN  
ROOM NO. XIV BONVIN BUILDING, IN PARIS.**

**PRESENT**

Eng Martin Manuhwa – Chairman  
Ben Rafemoyo - Secretary  
Kamel Ayadi – Immediate Past Chair  
Eng M Kanga.  
Eng Y Brijimohan  
Eng M VanVeelen  
Eng Manglin Pilay  
K Allen  
P Singh  
Eng J M Riungu  
Eng D Mareya  
Mr Neil Stransbury  
Darrel Danyluk  
Andrew Lamb  
Farai Mavhiya  
Paul Jowitt  
N Kimura  
Rodolfhe Karam  
ICE Representative  
Brian Dacal  
Tom Mckune  
Vassils Economopoulos

**IN ATTENDANCE** Eng B Rafemoyo

ITEM	DETAILS	ACTION
1.	<b>NOTICE OF MEETING</b>  Notice of the meeting, having been circulated electronically was taken as read.	All
2.	<b>OPENING REMARKS</b>  The secretary to the Committee, Ben Rafemoyo, called the meeting to order and welcomed all members present. He proceeded to introduce Eng Martin Manuhwa the incoming chairman of the CAC Standing Committee. He indicated that this was Eng Manuhwa's first meeting as chairman after taking over from Mr Kamel Ayadi, with effect from April 2014. Eng Martin Manuhwa took the floor and started off by welcoming everyone and thanking all for attending the CAC meeting. He went further to implore all participants to feel free to freely express their opinions as	All



ITEM	DETAILS	ACTION
	candidly as they consider necessary.	
3.	<b>APPROVAL OF THE AGENDA AND PREVIOUS MINUTES</b>  The proposed agenda for the CAC meeting was adopted without amendment.  The meeting was advised and noted the absence of the minutes of the previous meeting. Members present agreed that the meeting proceed with deliberations of the day even though it meant doing so without the minutes. Members of the Committee were given latitude to bring for discussion any matters they may recall and require attention of the Committee.	Agenda approved unamended
4.	<b>APOLOGIES</b>  No apologies were received from members	
5.	<b>FEEDBACK ON ACTIVITIES BY THE COMMITTEE AFTER SINGAPORE</b> <ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• Anti- Bribery (ISO 37001) was raised in the last meeting in Singapore and this matter was now work in progress. To this end the "Train The Trainer" is currently underway and GIAC was commended for providing the training material.</li><li>• South Africa has changed procurement system in trying to curb corruption. Now the activity is carried out by non-engineers and this has brought about other challenges where wrong materials are bought because of lack of knowledge.</li><li>• Other countries with alternative procurement systems? In UK CoST is now the system being used for procurement. The document on this system will be circulated to members for their noting and customize for use if so wished.</li><li>• In Kenya the Engineering procurement is done on the basis of a guide of minimum rates and though there is tendering, the prices are based on minimum charge rates.</li><li>• In Zimbabwe the same is largely the same case as reported by Kenya.</li><li>• In Canada they use pre-qualification though that varies from place to place and all things being equal, the lowest price gets the tender.</li><li>• In Macedonia the price and quality are the determinants but subjectivity is a huge challenge. The</li></ul>	Sub-Committee on Procurement be set to give Guidelines to CAC for GA Approval by Dec 2015  Engineers Canada to lead this initiative and advise of progress by date of GA in Kyoto



ITEM	DETAILS	ACTION
	<p>cost plus quality principle may still cause a problem and it is all about ethics on those choosing the best offer.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>In China they consider anti-corruption as very critical and those caught in breach can face death penalties and this has addressed the problem to a large extent.</li> <li>In Australia they need more visibility on the controls and initiatives against corruption.</li> </ul> <p>The totality of the inputs by member countries on this grave matter, seems to indicate that there is need to develop a guideline and initiatives on how to raise awareness in regard to how expertise in Engineering Service will be procured. It may be necessary to solicit inputs from member countries and develop a position paper at WFEO level and this will be given to the Executive Board and Council for approval before this is given to Governments as guidelines. A committee of four, headed by Manglin Pillay of South Africa. The other members are from China, Macedonia and .....?</p>	
6.	<p><b>THE CAC WEB-PAGE</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>The web-page for the CAC was presented by the expert from the WFEO.</li> </ul> <p>The documents of the committee will be posted on the website. This will include minutes and related write ups and items in the compendium. The Committee has two codes so far and these are to be put on the webpage. The ethics code could be linked to the webpage and to be translated to the main UN languages. The bottom of the webpage should accommodate the "contact us"</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>The Committee commended WFEO for a website which is now a lot better than before with all the materials.</li> </ul>	<p>To dynamically update web site.</p> <p>Chair and all members.</p>
7.	<p><b>THE CAC STC ASSESSMENT REVIEW</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>The assessment review for the committee was carried out to assess the Committee and the results thereof, were tabled for inputs / discussion by Members of the committee. The chairman opened the floor for comments and inputs from participants. Eng Martin Van-Velen who is a member of the assessment team provided a summary of the review process. The meeting was advised that following the self</li> </ul>	<p>The performance of CAC will be improved accordingly to exceed expectation. The 4 year</p>



ITEM	DETAILS	ACTION
	<p>assessment, the documentation is submitted to the assessors who will provide the collective feedback obtained from their rank and file.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• The committee will be renamed as Transparency Committee.</li></ul> <p>This was seen by the participants as being though the name needs to be revisited still. Consultations will continue and it was agreed that for the time being, the recommendation is for the adoption of the proposed new name (Ethics and Transparency Committee) while room is still open for more inputs to eventually come up with an agreed name.</p> <p>Several anti-corruption initiatives and guidelines have been established in the international construction and engineering industry namely:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• GIAC</li><li>• CoST</li><li>• WEF PACT - (World Economic Forum - Partnering against Corruption Initiative) The meeting agreed that an International approach via a WFEO STC is still the best way to carry out the Anti- Corruption message. A question was raised whether the Committee was aligned to Transparency International. The chairman explained that this was work in progress.</li></ul> <p>In the ensuing discussion it was agreed that the ISO 37001 has to be fully embark end and as such, training has to be developed.</p> <p>Feedback from members on what they were doing on Anti- Corruption:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• Nigeria is holding anti-corruption seminars and these have been well supported and the UPADI initiative was fully utilized.</li></ul>	<p>strategic plan and should provide feedback on metrics: Chair</p>
8.	<p><b>BUDGETARY ISSUES</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• The Committee's budgetary support was granted by ECZ .</li><li>• WFEO has assisted where necessary.</li><li>• These amounts have assisted in the funding of the direct costs of the committee during the year under review.</li></ul>	<p>Annual Budget approved.</p>



ITEM	DETAILS	ACTION
	<p>It was suggested that WFEO may need to consider use of the Ethics index, among others.</p> <p>It was also suggested that the Committee may need to come up with a concept paper on how to rank various countries and such can be obtained from the ratings of the other bodies such as Transparency International, e.t.c. A letter can be written to the Transparency International to ask them to accept a working relationship with the Standing Committee. It was also mentioned that 9 December is the Anti-Corruption Day and countries are expected to provide an activity plan for that day as individual member countries.</p> <p>The chairman went on to present a snap-short of the Rule Of Law Index.</p> <p>He explained that there are four largely measured parameters such as Accountable Governance, Publicized and Stable laws that protect fundamental rights, Accessible, fair and efficient process and Access to Justice. The Chairman was going to circulate the document so that nominated members on the STC can come up with some criteria to be used by the Committee.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• Kenya is holding annual conferences where presentations on Anti-Corruption are made and there is now a feeling in the country that engineers could be the major culprits in the propagation of corruption on major projects. On each of such projects, engineers are responsible for signing off such designs and the projects implementation.</li><li>• In Nigeria the Council on Regulation of Engineering signed an MOU with an arm of government that ensures that those who violate the procurement laws are tried and the Tribunal include members from the engineering practice. This is meant to try and bring sanity in the practice and stamp out corruption.</li></ul> <p>The Committee Chairman tabled the Strategic Plan and Sub-Committee structure. The Advisory Board was also presented for information to the participants.</p>	Committee Chair 27/11/15
9.	<b>STRATEGIC PLAN AND ACTION PLANS</b>  The strategic plan is organized into themes using the mission objectives of the WFEO and the WFEO - CAC as	Plan approved for



ITEM	DETAILS	ACTION
	<p>the context for the work.</p> <p>The Strategic Plan was adopted by the meeting as presented with an additional activity to accommodate Women and Young Engineers Operations and Budget was presented -WFEO Website The Secretariat have provided all the materials to be placed on the CAC portion of WFEO's website. This will be updated dynamically.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• <b>Membership</b> Secretariat will maintain a current list of members and their contact information. Periodically CAC members will be polled to ensure their contact information and membership details remain accurate</li><li>• <b>Budget</b> The current budget is \$82 000.00 and the Committee will however require budgetary support from WFEO in order to be able to fund all its activities.</li></ul> <p>The Committee has been hosted by Zimbabwe since the last four years and has applied to continue for the next four years in line with the 'two terms' maximum rule.</p> <p>There was a general agreement that South Africa will provide the team of young engineers to do the play of Ethicana at the Kyoto Japan conference.</p>	submission to WFEO Ex-board
10.	<p><b>PAPERS PRESENTED DURING THE WORKSHOP SESSION</b></p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"><li>i. The chair presented a paper on corruption: The highlights included the fact that corruption quite common in public sector as well as between public and private sector (procurement).</li><li>ii. Neil Stansbury from GIACC presented a paper on BS 10500 and ISO 37001 This is a standard on Ant-bribery. Bribery is now widely acknowledged as a significant business risk in many countries and sectors.</li></ol> <p>Going back in the past, Bribery was like the norm until many treaties were signed by progressive countries during the last 15 years, requiring member states to implement ant-corruption laws and procedures Most countries have changed their laws in accordance with the treaties they would have signed. He also explained that the UK Bribery</p>	



ITEM	DETAILS	ACTION
	<p>Act 2010 which makes an organization criminally liable for any bribery that may take place in its course of business transactions. Prosecution have started happening and a number have taken place with many examples that could be cited.</p> <p>A proper systems approach is required to curb bribery in Organizations.</p> <p>Implementation of systematic anti-bribery systems in organizations becomes an imperative. In this regard, organizations are starting to look for international benchmarks on anti-bribery best practice and proof that their clients, contractors, agents joint ventures partners and major subcontractors are not involved in bribery.</p> <p>* The Subject matter was covered in full in the presentation slides by Neil Stansbury and Martin Manuhwa.</p> <p>The presentation raised a lot of interest and the discussion which ensued was very lively and the sum total of all that was the need for all member countries to lobby their Standards Associations to support the ISO 37001 standard so that it gets sufficient members in order for it to be an approved standard.</p> <p>iii) The presentation by Muriel Poison. Her presentation was on risk assessment and corruption in education systems. Working with Civil Society and Government they have been promoting anti-corruption in education and this has benefited young engineers and the emphasis is in behaviour change. They involve professionals as well to come forward and explain how best the young Engineers can address ethical and behavioral issues. There is also need to check reliability of qualifications held by professionals as well as procurement of goods and services. In this regard a number of cases can be cited where corruption in building of schools where some structures have collapsed due to earthquakes and this has exposed the children. There is need to ensure that there are systematic procurement systems in the public sector. She proposed that there is need to involve young people in dealing with</p>	



ITEM	DETAILS	ACTION
	<p>ethics and behavioral issues. She recommended that those interested in the work they do can visit their website. The chairman indicated the need to develop an MOU which will create a relationship between the committee and her organization.</p> <p>Resources include published cases for each country and statistics on the educational related corruption cases. Leakages of school funding and other related matters such as ghost teachers/teacher absence. The links on their website, leads into other webpages related to the issue of corruption in the education sector.</p> <p>The committee will ensure that there is close liaison and cooperation with all relevant organization for the mutual benefit.</p> <p>iv) A presentation by Andrew Lamb summed it all up and focuses mainly on the work they were carrying out and progress made so far.</p> <p>For details of his presentation, see the attached slides.</p>	
v)	<p><b>ADJOURNMENT</b></p> <p>The meeting ended on a very high note with members and participants committing themselves to hard work in discharging the mandate of the Committee for the benefit of the Engineering Community and the publics at large.</p> <p>With no other items to discuss, the meeting was adjourned.</p>	

**Signed :** .....

**CAC Chairman**